



Article The Life and Death of *Jamoytius kerwoodi* White; A Silurian Jawless Nektonic Herbivore?

Michael E. Brookfield 回

Jackson School of Geosciences, University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX 78712, USA; mbrookfi44@gmail.com

Abstract: *Jamoytius kerwoodi*, is a primitive, eel-like jawless vertebrate found uniquely in an Early Silurian (Llandovery epoch; 444–433 Ma) horizon near Lesmahagow, Scotland. This species is a rare component of a low-diversity dominantly nektonic detritus-feeding and herbivorous fauna living over an anoxic bottom and is found at the transition from a marine-influenced, probably brackish-water, deep-water basin to a shallower-water, less saline and likely freshwater basin. In the absence of true teeth, *Jamoytius* was probably a detritivore or herbivore feeding on *Dictyocaris*. *Jamoytius* may have a common ancestor with living lampreys, especially as their ectoparasitic mode of life might have evolved from ancestral detritivores or herbivores.

Keywords: vertebrate; Jamoytius; lamprey; herbivore; parasite; Silurian

1. Introduction

Jamoytius kerwoodi White was a primitive, eel-like jawless fish that lived in the Llandovery epoch (444–433 Ma) of the Early Silurian period [1] (Figure 1). The fossil is preserved as rare carbonized films on bedding planes in one laminated siltstone horizon in the bank of the Logan water in the Lesmahagow inlier of Lanarkshire, SW Scotland [2]. It was once considered the most primitive known vertebrate [1], but with additional studies, its affinities are now debatable [3–8]. Because the interpretations of such exceptionally preserved soft-bodied fossils is difficult, observed features can be interpreted in different ways [9–11] (Figure 2). Various cladistic analyses of *Jamoytius* with other jawless vertebrates, using different character codings, give divergent results [7,12–20]. Choice of the in-group taxa affects its placement [17,21,22]. The position of *Jamoytius* on cladograms has consequently not stabilized, though it often appears as a sister taxon to euphaneropids, and/or lampreys, and/or anaspids [5,15,17,23–25] (Figure 3).



Figure 1. *Jamoytius* reconstructions: (**A**) with ventral "lamprey" mouth (with permission from Nobu Tamura); (**B**) with terminal suspension/detritus feeding mouth ([2], plate 11).



Citation: Brookfield, M.E. The Life and Death of *Jamoytius kerwoodi* White; A Silurian Jawless Nektonic Herbivore? *Foss. Stud.* **2024**, *2*, 77–91. https://doi.org/10.3390/fossils2020003

Academic Editor: Eric Buffetaut

Received: 6 December 2023 Revised: 22 March 2024 Accepted: 25 March 2024 Published: 9 April 2024



Copyright: © 2024 by the author. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).



Figure 2. *Jamoytius* fossil and inferred features: (**A**) with the conflicting interpretations of White [1], in bold, and Ritchie [2,18,25,30] in plain italics (modified from Sansom et al. [31] (Plate 1); (**B**) body parts and topological interpretation of the holotype (NHM P11284a), from [31] (text Figure 5).



Figure 3. Examples of cladistic analyses showing three interpretations for *Jamoytius*. (**A**): Shu et al. (1999) [19], (**B**): Donoghue et al. (2001) [21], where Ostraco/Jawed represents other ostracoderms and jawed vertebrates, (**C**): Sansom et al. (2010) [31].

As a sister taxon to the lampreys, *Jamoytius* has been compared with parasitic lampreys which attack fish. But, only 18 of the 38 known species of lamprey, are carnivorous [26]. Living nonparasitic lampreys appear to be derived from parasitic species with heterochronic shifts in metamorphosis [27]. Adult non-parasitic lampreys tend to be somewhat smaller (10 to 20 cm long) than adult parasitic lampreys (15 to 120 cm long) (Figure 4), whose size is related to life history trade offs; either become a parasite/predator with high growth potential, fecundity and mortality, or remain a detritivore with lower growth rates, fecundities and mortality [26,28], Size is, however, not diagnostic and cannot be used to distinguish parasitic from non-parasitic forms [29], and the supposed parasitic Paleozoic forms may not have been such, but grazers or scavengers (see below).



Figure 4. Living and oldest fossil (Devonian) lampreys. (**A**) Parasitic sea lamprey (*Petromyzon marinus* Linnaeus), 35–60 cm long; (**B**) American brook lamprey (*Lethenteron appendix* DeKay) 15–25 cm long (**A**,**B**) courtesy of North Carolina Wildlife Resources Commission; (**C**) Devonian parasitic fossil lamprey (*Priscomyzon riniensis* Gess et al. [22], ~5 cm long (public domain).

The fossil evidence for early evolution of lampreys is limited. Based on both morphological and molecular evidence, Brownstein and Near [32] estimated that 90% of living lamprey clades originated only since the late Cretaceous. As reconstructed by Reeves and Sansom [11], carnivorous lampreys evolved from non-carnivorous early Paleozoic forms in the Jurassic, when innovations of their feeding apparatus may underlie their evolutionary increase of the body size and the 'modernization' of their life-history during the Jurassic period [33], and then radiated from the late Cretaceous times (~100 Ma) and especially from Miocene times (~25 Ma) onwards into many both carnivorous and non-carnivorous forms.

Only four undoubted Palaeozoic lamprey species have been recorded, the Devonian (419–359 Ma) *Priscomyzon riniensis*, from South Africa considered the oldest parasitic lamprey [22]. *Priscomyzon*, and three from the Carboniferous (359–299 Ma) [8]. These Paleozoic lampreys might not, however, be parasitic as conventionally assumed, as they have tiny dentition and a small buccal cavity (which accommodates the anti-coagulant secreting glands and food processing in living parasitic lampreys) and lack an ammocoete stage [8,34]. Wu et al. [33] speculated that the well-developed oral discs and attaching skills of these early lampreys might be adaptations to grazing algal mats, which would fit with the mode of life proposed here for *Jamoytius* and other similar forms like *Euthanerops*.

As a sister taxon to the anaspids (Figure 3B), *Jamoytius* resembles the genera, *Loganellia*, *Birkenia*, and, especially, *Lasanius* [35] (Figure 5). *Loganellia* also occurs in the *Jamoytius* bed, while *Birkenia* and *Lasanius* occur in slightly younger fish beds in the Lesmahagow succession [36,37].





Jamoytius is often classified as a sister taxon to the Upper Devonian fish, *Euphanerops*, originally grouped together in the Jamoytiforms [38] (Figure 3C), though many of the structures in the available fossils remain unexplained [24]. Several other euphaneropids have now been recognized: one, *Ciderius cooperi* van der Brugghen from the fish beds above the *Jamoytius* bed at Lesmahagow [39]. These are similar to *Jamoytius*, both in anatomy and possibly mode of life (Figure 6).



Figure 6. (**A**) *Euphanerops longaevus* reconstruction (Upper Devonian, Canada) https://www.miguasha. ca/mig-en/euphanerops.php (public domain) (consulted 7 August 2023); (**B**) *Euphanerops longaevus* as a swimming nektonic detritivore/herbivore (with permission from Nobu Tamura); (**C**) various euphaneropids; *Ciderius couperi*, (Lower Silurian), *Achanarella trewinii*, *Cornovichthys blaaeweni* (Middle Devonian), *Endiolepis aneri* (Upper Devonian) (with permission from Nobu Tamura).

The mode of life of *Jamoytius kerwoodi* is thus unresolved; even its life orientation is still not certain [31]. In this paper I am not particularly concerned with its affinities, but with its mode of life as inferred from its anatomy (which bears, of course, on its affinities), adaptative morphology and palaeoenvironment based on the sedimentology of the enclosing strata and the lifestyles of it and its associated biota.

2. Anatomy

Because the preservation of soft-bodied organism like *Jamoytius* is so variable, and because there are often so few fossils of them preserved, then even their basic anatomy is subject to different interpretations, leading to radically different reconstructions and affinities [11].

Jamoytius had an elongated body, ranging from 14–18 cm long by 3–4 cm wide, a cartilaginous skeleton, akin to the branchial basket of lampreys, and weakly mineralized scales [31]. Earlier reconstructions show side-fins running the length of its body, but these are now interpreted as artifacts formed as a corpse was squashed post-burial. A ring-like stain, interpreted as cartilage, encircles the very small 'mouth' (seen as 0.5 to 0.7 mm in diameter in Figure 2), which suggested to Ritchie [2,18,25] that it was an ancestral parasitic lamprey. *Jamoytius*, however, apparently had no true teeth or teeth-like structures, in its 'mouth' [31], If *Jamoytius* had rasping keratin teeth like living parasitic lampreys, as Stensiö [40] inferred for Norwegian anapsids, then these should probably be preserved carbonized, as is much of the rest of the animal (Figure 2). The third most abundant vertebrate fossils (after bones and teeth) are keratin-derived materials such as skin and feathers [41,42].

The controversy about whether this 'mouth' was anterior terminal, or subterminal ventral, seems to be resolved in favour of the latter [31]. Towards the anterior end, many specimens preserve a pair of linear features composed of serially repeated, contiguous, sub-rectangular shapes, interpreted as branchial openings [31]. The anterior of *Jamoytius* has room for a piston-like tongue comparable with living parasitic lampreys [34]. In living parasitic lampreys, this holds the biting and cutting plates used to parasitize fish, which are not present in *Jamoytius*. On the other hand, such plates would not be required to eat soft vegetation, which is a possibility considering the holes in associated *Dictyoocaris* (see Section 5), and *Jamoytius* does not have the lamprey lips used for suction [43].

Most specimens do not preserve the posterior portion of *Jamoytius*, and where they do, it is too faint to be seen clearly [31]. So, the inferred hypocercal tail is reconstructed only by analogy with other near-contemporary anaspids, like *Birkenia* and *Lasanius* [17,44].

3. Mode of Life of Jamoytius

Jamoytius has been compared with parasitic lampreys which attack fish [2] (Figures 2A and 3). But, only 18 of the 38 known species of lamprey, are carnivorous. The ancestral crown lamprey was probably a freshwater nonparasitic species, some of which evolved into parasites [32]. Living non-parasitic lampreys are smaller (less than 40 cm long) than parasitic sea lampreys (35–120 cm long), and all inhabit freshwater [26]. The non-carnivorous lampreys do not eat at all, since they have a nonfunctional intestine, only live for four to six months on the energy stored when young; as a result, they typically have small mouths and poorly-developed teeth, useless for attaching to a host, and die after spawning [45]. For example, *Lethenteron appendix*, the American brook lamprey, has small larvae (1–2 cm long) that feed on algae and detritus for between three and seven years, before metamorphosing into sexually mature adults (15–25 cm long) [46]. The size and anatomy of *Jamoytius* is more compatible with non-carnivorous living lampreys, though the Devonian inferred parasitic lamprey, *Priscomyzon riniensis*, is also very small [22] (Figure 4C).

The comparable agnathans, have terminal anterior mouths which do not appear to be protrusible (Figure 5). Such mouths are often found among omnivorous mid-water feeders, which eating anything available, by grabbing bits of food as they move [47].

4. Paleoenvironments

The *Jamoytius*-bearing horizon is one of several eurypterid- and fish-bearing units in the Silurian (Llandoverian; 444–433 Ma) Priesthill Group of the Lesmahagow inlier in the Midland Valley of Scotland [18,30,48]. It is exposed at Birk Knowes in a cliff next to the Logan Water (NS737346) (Figure 7A) near the top of the Patrick Burn Formation, an over 500-m-thick section of alternating grey sandstones, siltstones, and mudstones [37,49]

(Figure 7B). The sediments of the Patrick Burn Formation change gradually upwards from deeper water interbedded mudstone/turbidite sandstone facies into shallower water interbedded mudstone/cross-bedded and laminated sandstone facies [37,49]. This is accompanied by changes in the taxonomy and ecology of the fossil biotas from marine to freshwater [30,37,49] (Figure 7B).





Figure 7. (**A**) Birk Knowes exposure of *Jamoytius* beds. (**B**) Section of Priesthill Group with fossil associations, ranges, and inferred salinity (modified from Lovelock, 1998 [22]).

Throughout the Patrick Burn Formation, and in the *Jamoytius* bed itself, there is a complete absence of burrowing organisms and there are no tracks or trails on the bedding plane surfaces [37] The undisturbed nature of the sediments, together with abundant pyrite and organic matter, indicates anaerobic bottom conditions in very quiet water subject to periodic underflows [30]; in keeping with the abundance of *Ceratiocaris*. Geochemical evidence indicates a gradual salinity drop through the upper part of the Priesthill Group, which contains all the fish beds [49].

The *Jamoytius* bed itself is about 10 m thick and consists of alternating fine-grained thin sandstones, deposited by turbidity currents, and varved siltstones in which the varves consist of a lower graded siltstone overlain by an organic-rich muddy layer: the latter enclose most of the fossils [30,49] (Figure 8A,B). The bounding sandstones are low-angle tabular cross-bedded fine-grained mature muddy quartz- and felspathic-sandstones [49], deposited by sand waves in shallow water by storms [37,50] (Figure 8C,D). The deeper water *Jamoytius* bed with its turbidite sandstones and laminated siltstone contrasts markedly with the enclosing shallow water cross-bedded fine sandstones and testify to great fluctuations in water levels and climate at millennial scales typical of marginal marine and semi-arid lake basins such as those of Lake Cariaco in northern Venezuela and Lake Chad in the central Sahara [51,52].



Figure 8. Sediments; (**A**) view of part of *Jamoytius* bed showing varved siltstones alternating with graded fine-grained sandstones; (**B**) photomicrograph of *Jamoytius* bed varved siltstone showing lower graded silt layer overlain by organic-rich silt cap, then coarser basal silt layer of overlying varve; (**C**) view of outcrop of fine-grained quartz-sandstones overlying *Jamoytius* bed; (**D**) photomicrograph of fine-grained sandstone from (**C**), dominated by subangular quartz grains with rare plagioclase felspar, in carbonate cement.

Both the *Jamoytius* bed, and higher fish-bearing beds at Lesmahagow, have alternations of fine silt-clay couplets (varves) which contain the biota, and olive-grey massive mudstones which are barren [53]. In the *Jamoytius* horizon, itself, the alternations of laminated siltstones and graded quartz sandstones are almost identical to those of Cariaco basin in Venezuela [54,55]. Water circulation inside this partially isolated basin is restricted, which, combined with high annual primary productivity, causes it to be permanently anoxic at depth, where alternating light and dark coloured varved sediments correspond respectively to the winter-spring dry season and the summer-fall rainy season [56].

The tectonic situation of the Midland basin Silurian inliers is also comparable with that of the Cariaco and related basins along the northern Venezuelan coast. Both are complex basins between ocean and continent, which evolved through time from marine to freshwater continental conditions due to shortening and inversion caused by major strike-slip faulting, occupying about he same ~100 Ma time period, Cretaceous to Recent for Venezuela, and Silurian through Devonian for the Midland Valley [57,58].

5. Palaeoecology

Though the lower Partick Burn Formation has transported marine, or brackish water, fossils in turbidite sandstone, which shows source connections with the sea, the lack of normal marine planktonic organisms above these basal beds is clear evidence that the oceanic connection was tenuous at best [37].

The Jamoytius bed lies above the Podowrinella (sands) and orthocone-Ceratiocaris (clays) biofacies, between shallow water unfossiliferous sandstones [37] (Figure 6). The Podowrinella biofacies is in turbidite sandstones and has been transported from shallower water. It has benthonic scavengers (4 trilobite species, 1 ostracod), attached filter feeders (3 brachiopods, 1 bivalve, crinoid ossicles, bryozoa), herbivores (1 gastropod), free living filter feeders (Tentaculites, Cornulitids). This fauna suggests living conditions in shallow turbulent marine, possibly slightly brackish, water [37]. The orthocone-Ceratiocaris biofacies is in the clays and has only the podshrimp, Ceratiocaris papilio, rare orthocones and the occasional patch of thelodont scales. The orthocones are upright in the sediment and have floated in and settled with decomposition gas in chambers holding them upright as they settled though the water. The Ceratiocaris and thelodonts, in the absence of marine fossils in situ, indicate brackish to freshwater environments [37].

For the fossil biota of the *Jamoytius* bed, I use the list of Lovelock [37], which list only those fossils from the actual laminated siltstones. Peach and Horne [59] believed the Birk Knowes outcrop to be equivalent to those at Shank Castle, which was later shown to be incorrect [49]. Unfortunately, this mis-correlation has led to confusion over the attribution of some fossils to the *Jamoytius* bed [37] (pp. 166–167), an error repeated through successive editions of 'The Geology of Scotland' [60]. The single example of the blind "horseshoe crab", *Cyamocephalus loganensis* Currie 1927, is a museum specimen, attributed to the *Jamoytius* bed only on similar lithology [61]. Hunter [62] never recorded from where he got his single specimen of the scorpion *Palaeophonus caledonicus*, though this might be a plant (Ritchie, 1963), and it was dubiously assigned to the *Jamoytius* horizon by Peach and Horne [59] (p. 574).

The actual fossil biota of the *Jamoytius* bearing laminated siltstone is dominated by the crustacean *Ceratiocaris papilio*, accompanied by the thelodont, *Loganellia scotica*, the enigmatic thylacocephalan crustacean? *Aniktozoon loganense* [63], *Dictyocaris slimoni*, most likely a plant thallus [30], and disc- and stem-shaped plants. Other members are rare to very rare. Rare members are the eurypterids *Slimonia acuminata*, *Jamoytius kerwoodi* itself and the molluscs. Very rare members are the eurypterids, *Erretopterus bilobus*, *Hughmilleria* sp., the ostracod, *Beyrichia* sp. (one specimen), and the problematica, *Taitia catena* and *Striatuncus scoticus* [30] (Table 1).

The phyllocarid, *Ceratiocaris*, or pod shrimp, is up to 30 cm long, and is the most abundant fossil. Living phyllocarids (leptostracans) are little know, but seem to prefer low energy conditions over mud bottoms, and are tolerant of low oxygen concentrations [64,65]. Although usually considered filter feeders, they can like shrimps, be opportunistic scavengers, eating plants, organic detritus, and any living or dead organism that does not eat them first [66–68].

Loganellia scoticus is up to 30 cm long, and was originally reconstructed as a bottom detritus feeder with heterocercal tail [69]: but it more likely lived as a nektonic feeder with hypocercal tail, as supposed for the anaspid *Birkenia*, especially considering the anoxic bottom over which it lived [30,70,71]. Indirect evidence comes from fossil scroll coprolites assigned to the anaspids *Birkenia* and *Loganellia*, which occur in post-Llandoverian varved siltstones in Northern Ireland, and are ascribed to detritus feeders [72].

Таха	Feeding Strategy	Frequency
Arthropods		
Ceratiocaris papilio	nektonic omnivore	very common
Slimonia acuminata	nektonic scavenger	rare
Erretopterus bilobus	nektonic carnivore	very rare
Ainiktozoon loganense	unknown	common
Beyrichias sp. (1 specimen) detritivore		very rare
Chordata		
Loganellia scotica	nektonic detritus/herbivore?	common
Jamoytius kerwoodi	nektonic detritus/herbivore?	rare
Loganellia grossi	nektonic detritus/herbivore?	very rare
Cephalopoda		
?Orthocone indeterminate	nektonic carnivore	very rare
Small (2 specimens)		
Gastropoda		
Platyschisma helicites	mobile herbivore, grazer	rare
(7 specimens)		
Bivalvia		
Pteritonella sp.	bysally attached suspension feeder	rare
Unknown		
Dictyocaris slimoni	plant primary producer?	very common
Plant		
Tatia catena	primary producer	very rare

Table 1. Taxa, ecology, and abundance of Jamoytius association biota.

Ainiktozoon, is about 12 cm long, and though originally described as an early chordate [73], is now more plausibly an arthropod, more precisely a thylacocephalan crustacean [63]. Its mode of life is unknown, though its abundance suggests an herbivore or detritus feeder rather than a carnivore as postulated for other thylacocephalans [74].

Other arthropods, which are sometimes attributed to the *Jamoytius* bed, come from the overlying Kip Burn Formation, now mostly covered by the waters of the Logan reservoir, including the millipede *Archidesmus loganensis* Peach, 1899 [59].

Dictyocaris slimoni, forms large carbonaceous sheets up to 30 cm in diameter, commonly pierced by variably sized circular holes up to 5 mm across, with raised rims [75,76] (Figure 9). *Dictyocaris* specimens were originally thought to be fragments of large arthropod carapaces, with the holes as parasitic injuries from *Jamoytius* mouths [30]. *Dictyocaris* is, however, never found even partially articulated, despite its association with articulated *Ceratiocaris* specimens which have no similar holes. And the large number of holes on the illustrated specimen also seems too many to be the results of parasitism, considering the size of *Jamoytius* (14–18 cm). *Dictyocaris* thus is likely a plant [30].



Figure 9. *Dictyocaris*: (**A**) thallus with holes; (**B**) drawing showing holes of varying sizes and raised rims (both from van der Brugghen, 1995 [76]).

The morphologies of the rare eurypterids in the *Jamoytius* bed are more easily interpreted as those of nektonic scavengers, because they have none of the specialized adaptations for catching prey found in eurypterids in higher fish beds at Lesmahagow, such as the large spiny grasping arms of the mixopterid *Lanarkopterus dolichoschelus* [77,78] (Figure 10A). For example, *Erettopterus* with its small pincers and compound eyes was probably a predator/ scavenger with high visual acuity, but it was not as highly specialized or active as other eurypterids [79]. Similarly, *Ainiktozoon* had likely neither the speed, nor the appendages, to catch a fast-moving *Loganellia* (Figure 10B).



Figure 10. (**A**) Reconstruction of *Lanarkopterus dolichelus* Ritchie 1968 (after Ritchie, 1968b [2]); (**B**) *Ainitkozoon* chasing a *Loganellia* (with permission from Nobu Tamura).

Of the rare molluscs and the small orthocone cephalopod recorded by Ritchie [30] in the *Jamoytius* horizon, the bivalve *Pterinea* is a byssally attached suspension feeder. Small clusters of *Pterinea* occur with carbonaceous patches, which may be floating plants to which they attached [30] (p. 149); such Pterinids often attach to floating vegetation [80], The low-spired gastropod *Platyschisma* is most likely a grazing or scavenging form [81]. The small orthocones are not part of the *Jamoytius* bed biota, and were transported in from another shallower water environment, as they occur in the turbidite sandstones interbedded with the laminated siltstones that have the vertebrates and the eurypterids (personal observations in 2022).

6. Discussion

The *Jamoytius* association is dominated by supposed omnivores and herbivore/detritus feeders, with primary production represented by phytoplankton and land plant spores and? algal thalluses (? *Dictyocaris*) that contribute the dark laminae within the siltstone beds (Figure 8B). There is no evidence for large scale transportation of the fossils after death: they simply settled into the anoxic bottom.

The *Jamoytius* reconstructions with a terminal mouth suggest a filter-feeder or a detritusfeeder, analogous to larval lampreys [82] (Figure 1C,E) and possibly to the Loganelliform thelodonts with which it is associated [83,84]: the latter are interpreted as pelagic slow swimmers in open water [85]. Larval lampreys can feed on highly concentrated food suspensions so thick that they border on organic deposits [86,87]. *Jamoytius*, however, lacks any obvious adaptations to suspension feeding [88], and the more likely anterior ventral position of the mouth indicates particulate feeding or grazing [47]. The mouth-sized holes in the possible plant *Dictyocaris* suggest its soft tissues (there are no signs of cuticles) was grazed by *Jamoytius* without teeth, which may have been later evolved in younger forms like the Devonian *Priscomyzon*.

A bottom detritus feeding life style proposed by Parrington (1958) [89] is unlikely given the anoxic bottom inferred from sedimentology, and the hypocercal tail which would give lift to a fish whose morphology also suggests an active lifestyle, like the related euphaneropids [90]. Like euphaneropids, *Jamoytius* resembles elongate arrow-like bony fish, like pike (*Esox* spp.) and barracuda (*Sphyraena* spp.), with posterior dorsal and anal fins, which assist the tail in bursts of rapid acceleration, but are inefficient at steady swimming [91]. Ritchie (1968) considered that its highly developed metamerism (a linear series of body segments fundamentally similar in structure) and large eyes of *Jamoytius* indicated a very active, fast-swimming vertebrate.

Sedimentological and palaeoecological characteristics of the *Jamoytius*-associated organisms indicate that *Jamoytius* lived in a brackish water environment in which the bottom waters and sediments were anoxic, and inhospitable to benthos and a predominantly planktonic and nektonic biota lived only in the overlying oxic waters (Figure 11). A benthonic mode of life for any of the *Jamoytius* association organisms is unlikely. *Jamoytius* and its likely euphaneropid sister taxa, despite the latter's autapomorphic, elongated branchial basket, could plausibly be stem lampreys [5], especially considering that the earliest lampreys are interpreted as non-parasitic [32]. Lampreys may initially have evolved as herbivorous organisms and only later developed ectoparasitic modes of life [34,86,92]. The tiny preserved dentition in Devonian *Priscomyzon riniensis* might be an evolutionary advance for algal grazing from inefficient toothless *Jamoytius*.



Figure 11. Palaeoecological sketch of the *Jamoytius* association living over an anoxic bottom (modified from Lovelock, 1998, [22], Figure 4.3).

7. Conclusions

Jamoytius is associated with a low-diversity dominantly nektonic detritus and herbivorous fauna living over an anoxic bottom, at the transition from a marine-influenced, probably brackish-water and deep-water basin to a shallower-water, less saline and likely freshwater basin. *Jamoytius* was likely a free-living surface feeding detritivore/herbivore.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Data Availability Statement: Data is contained within the article.

Acknowledgments: This study is part of an ongoing study on the palaeoenvironments and ages of the Silurian inliers of the Midland Valley of Scotland. I thank my colleagues, Elizabeth Catlos and Hector Garza for help during joint field and Susan Turner for a detailed review. I also thank Reviewer 3 for an outstandingly helpful and constructive review. This paper is dedicated to Alex Ritchie, who sadly died on 16 November 2023 at the age of 88.

Conflicts of Interest: The author declares no conflicts of interest.

References

- 1. White, E.I. Jamoytius kerwoodi, a new chordate from the Silurian of Lanarkshire. Geol. Mag. 1946, 83, 89–97. [CrossRef]
- Ritchie, A. New evidence on *Jamoytius kerwoodi* White, an important ostracoderm from the Silurian of Lanarkshire, Scotland. *Palaeontology* 1968, 11, 21–39.
- Chevrinais, M.; Johanson, Z.; Trinajstic, K.; Long, J.; Morel, C.; Renaud, C.; Cloutier, R. Evolution of vertebrate postcranial complexity: Axial skeleton regionalization and paired appendages in a Devonian jawless fish. *Palaeontology* 2018, *61*, 949–961. [CrossRef]
- 4. Janvier, P. Early Vertebrates. Oxford Monographs on Geology and Geophysics 33; Clarendon Press: Oxford, UK, 1996; 393p. [CrossRef]
- 5. Janvier, P. Early Jawless Vertebrates and Cyclostome Origins. Zool. Sci. 2008, 25, 1045–1056. [CrossRef]
- 6. Keating, J.N.; Donaghue, P.C.J. Histology and affinity of anaspids, and the early evolution of the vertebrate dermal skeleton. *Proc. R. Soc.* **2016**, *B283*, 20152917. [CrossRef]
- Miyashita, T.; Coates, M.; Farrar, R.; Larson, P.; Manning, P.; Wogelius, R.; Edwards, N.; Anné, J.; Bergmann, U.; Palmer, A.; et al. Hagfish from the Cretaceous Tethys Sea and a reconciliation of the morphological-molecular conflict in early vertebrate phylogeny. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* 2019, 116, e2146–e2151. [CrossRef]
- Miyashita, T.; Gess, R.W.; Tietjen, K.; Coates, M.I. Non-ammocoete larvae of Palaeozoic stem lampreys. *Nature* 2021, 591, 408–412. [CrossRef]
- Donoghue, P.C.J.; Purnell, M.A. Distinguishing heat from light in debate over controversial fossils. *BioEssays* 2009, 31, 178–189. [CrossRef]
- 10. Lingham-Soliar, T. The Vertebrate Integument: Origin and Evolution, Volume 1; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2014; 268p.
- 11. Reeves, J.C.; Sansom, R.S. Multivariate mapping of ontogeny, taphonomy and phylogeny to reconstruct problematic fossil taxa. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **2023**, *290*, 20230333. [CrossRef]
- 12. Forey, P.L. Yet more reflections on agnatha-gnathostome relationships. J. Vertebr. Paleontol. 1984, 4, 330–343. [CrossRef]
- 13. Forey, P.L. Agnathans recent and fossil, and the origin of jawed vertebrates. Rev. Fish Biol. Fish. 1995, 5, 267–303. [CrossRef]
- 14. Forey, P.L.; Janvier, P. Agnathans and the origin of jawed vertebrates. Nature 1993, 361, 129–134. [CrossRef]
- 15. Janvier, P. The phylogeny of the Craniata, with reference to the significance of fossil 'agnathans'. *J. Vertebr. Paleontol.* **1981**, *1*, 121–159. [CrossRef]
- 16. Kuraku, S.; Kuratani, S. Time Scale for Cyclostome Evolution Inferred with a Phylogenetic Diagnosis of Hagfish and Lamprey cDNA Sequences. *Zool. Sci.* 2006, 23, 1053–1064. [CrossRef]
- 17. Reeves, J.C.; Wogelius, R.; Keating, J.; Sansom, R.S. *Lasanius*, an exceptionally preserved Silurian jawless fish from Scotland. *Palaeontology* **2023**, *66*, e12643. [CrossRef]
- 18. Ritchie, A. A new interpretation of Jamoytius kerwoodi White. Nature 1960, 188, 647-649. [CrossRef]
- 19. Shu, D.; Luo, H.-L.; Conway-Morris, S.; Zhang, X.; Hu, S.; Han, J.; Zhu, M.; Li, Y.; Chen, L.-Z. A Lower Cambrian vertebrate from South China. *Nature* **1999**, 402, 42–46. [CrossRef]
- 20. Turner, S. Early vertebrates: Analysis from microfossil evidence. Recent Adv. Orig. Early Radiat. Vertebr. 2004, 65, 67–94.
- Donoghue, P.C.J.; Smith, M.P.; Sansom, I.J. The origin and early evolution of chordates: Molecular clocks and the fossil record. In *Telling the Evolutionary Time: Molecular Clocks and the Fossil Record*; Donoghue, P.C.J., Smith, M.P., Eds.; CRC Press: London, UK, 2003; pp. 190–223.
- 22. Gess, R.W.; Coates, M.I.; Rubidge, B.S. A lamprey from the Devonian period of South Africa. Nature 2006, 443, 981–984. [CrossRef]
- 23. Donoghue, P.C.J.; Keating, J.N. Early vertebrate evolution. *Palaeontology* **2014**, *57*, 879–893. [CrossRef]
- 24. Janvier, P.; Arsenault, M. The anatomy of *Euphanerops longaevus* Woodward, 1900, an anaspid-like jawless vertebrate from the Upper Devonian of Miguasha, Quebec, Canada. *Godiversitas* **2007**, *29*, 143–216.
- 25. Ritchie, A. Conflicting interpretations of the Silurian agnathan, Jamoytius. Scott. J. Geol. 1984, 20, 249–256. [CrossRef]

- 26. Potter, I.C.; Gill, H.S.; Renaud, C.B.; Haoucher, D. The Taxonomy, Phylogeny, and Distribution of Lampreys. In *Lampreys: Biology, Conservation and Control*; Docker, M.F., Ed.; Springer: Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2015; pp. 35–73. [CrossRef]
- Docker, M.F. A review of the evolution of nonparasitism in lampreys an update of the paired species concept. In *Biology, Management, and Conservation of Lampreys in North America;* Brown, L., Chase, S., Mesa, M., Beamish, R., Moyle, P.B., Eds.; American Fisheries Society: Bethesda, MD, USA, 2009; pp. 71–114.
- Evans, T.M.; Limburg, K.E. Parasitism offers large rewards but carries high risks: Predicting parasitic strategies under different life history conditions in lampreys. J. Evol. Biol. 2019, 32, 794–805. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 29. Dawson, H.A.; Quintella, B.R.; Almeida, P.R.; Treble, A.J.; Jolley, J.C. The ecology of larval and metamorphosing lampreys. In *Lampreys: Biology, Conservation and Control*; Docker, M.F., Ed.; Springer: Berlin/Heidelberg, Germany, 2015; Volume 1, pp. 75–138.
- Ritchie, A. Palaeontological Studies on Scottish Silurian Fish Beds. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK, 1963; 170p.
- 31. Sansom, R.S.; Freedman, K.; Gabbott, S.E.; Aldridge, R.J.; Purnell, M.A. Taphonomy and affinity of an enigmatic Silurian vertebrate, *Jamoytius kerwoodi* White. *Palaeontology* **2010**, *53*, 1393–1409. [CrossRef]
- 32. Brownstein, C.D.; Near, T.J. Phylogenetics and the Cenozoic Radiation of lampreys. Curr. Biol. 2023, 33, 397–404. [CrossRef]
- 33. Wu, F.; Janvier, P.; Zhang, C. The rise of predation in Jurassic lampreys. Nat. Commun. 2023, 14, 6652. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 34. Mallatt, J. Vertebrate origins are informed by larval lampreys (ammocoetes): A response to Miyashita et al., 2021. *Zool. J. Linn. Soc.* 2023, *197*, 287–321. [CrossRef]
- 35. Blom, H.; Märss, T. The interrelationships and evolutionary history of anaspid fishes. In *Morphology, Phylogeny, and Paleobiogeography of Fossil Fishes*; Elliott, D.K., Maisey, J.G., Yu, X., Miao, D., Eds.; Verlag Dr. F. Pfeil, Munich: Munich, Germany, 2010; pp. 45–58.
- 36. Dineley, D. Silurian fossils fish sites of Scotland. In *Fossil Fishes of Great Britain*; Chapter 2; Geological Conservation Review Series; Dineley, D., Metcalf, S., Eds.; Joint Nature Conservation Committee: Peterborough, UK, 1999; Volume 16, pp. 33–62.
- Lovelock, C.E. Sedimentary Environments and Biofacies of the Silurian Inlier at Lesmahagow Midland Valley of Scotland. Ph.D. Thesis, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK, 1998; 448p.
- 38. Tarlo, L.B.H. Agnatha. In The Fossil Record; Harland, W.B., Ed.; London Geological Society: London, UK, 1967; pp. 629-636.
- 39. van der Brugghen, G. *Ciderius cooperi* gen. nov., sp. nov., the earliest known euphaneropid from the Lower Silurian of Scotland. *Neth. J. Geosci.* 2015, *94*, 279–288. [CrossRef]
- Stensiö, E.A. Les cyclostomes fossiles ou ostracodermes. In *Traite de Zoologie 13*; Grasse, P.-P., Ed.; Masson: Paris, France, 1958; pp. 173–425.
- Moyer, A.E.; Zheng, W.; Schweitzer, M.H. Keratin durability has implications for the fossil record: Results from a 10-year feather degradation experiment. *PLoS ONE* 2016, 11, e0157699. [CrossRef]
- Schweitzer, M.H.; Zheng, W.; Moyer, A.E.; Sjövall, P.; Lindgren, J. Preservation potential of keratin in deep time. *PLoS ONE* 2018, 13, e0206569. [CrossRef]
- 43. Richardson, M.K.; Admiraal, J.; Wright, G.M. Developmental anatomy of lampreys. *Biol. Rev.* 2010, *85*, 1–206. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 44. Blom, H. New Birkeniid anaspid from the Lower Devonian of Scotland and its phylogenetic implications. *Palaeontology* **2012**, *55*, 641–652. [CrossRef]
- 45. Cochran, P.A. Observations on giant American Brook Lamprey (Lampetra appendix). J. Freshw. Ecol. 2008, 23, 161–164. [CrossRef]
- Fuller, P.; Neilson, M. Lethenteron appendix; USGS Nonindigenous Aquatic Species Database: Gainesville, FL, USA, 2015. Available online: http://nas.er.usgs.gov/queries/FactSheet.aspx?speciesID=835 (accessed on 5 December 2023).
- 47. Oleh, M. Laboratory Manual on General and Special Ichthyology. World News Nat. Sci. 2018, 18, 1–51.
- 48. Clarkson, E.N.K.; Harper, D.T. Silurian of the Midland Valley of Scotland and Ireland. Geol. Today 2016, 32, 195–200. [CrossRef]
- Jennings, J.S. The geology of the Eastern Part of the Lesmahagow Inlier. Ph.D. Thesis, The University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK, 1961; 306p.
- 50. Harms, J.C.; Southard, J.B.; Spearing, D.R.; Walker, R.G. *Depositional Environments as Interpreted from Primary Sedimentary Structures and Stratification Sequences*; Society for Economic Petrology and Mineralogy: Tulsa, OK, USA, 1975; 161p. [CrossRef]
- Armitage, S.J.; Bristow, C.S.; Drake, N.A. West African monsoon dynamics inferred from abrupt fluctuations of Lake Mega-Chad. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 2015, 112, 8543–8548. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- González, C.; Dupont, L.M.; Behling, H.; Wefer, G. Neotropical vegetation response to rapid climate changes during the last glacial period: Palynological evidence from the Cariaco Basin. *Quat. Res.* 2008, 69, 217–230. [CrossRef]
- 53. Zolitschka, B.; Francus, P.; Antti, E.K.O.; Schimmelmann, A. Varves in lake sediments a review. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 2015, 117, 1–41. [CrossRef]
- Athearn, W.D. Sediment Cores from the Cariaco Trench, Venezuela; Unpublished Technical Report; Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution: Woods Hole, MA, USA, 1965; pp. 65–73. 20p.
- 55. Hughen, K.A.; Overpeck, J.T.; Peterson, L.C.; Anderson, R.F. The nature of varved sedimentation in the Cariaco Basin, Venezuela, and its paleoclimatic significance. *Geol. Soc. Spec. Publ.* **1996**, *116*, 171–183. [CrossRef]
- Muller-Karger, F.E.; Varela, R.; Thunell, R.; Scranton, M.; Bohrer, R.; Taylor, G.; Capelo, J.; Astor, Y.; Tappa, E.; Ho, T.Y.; et al. Annual cycle of primary production in the Cariaco Basin: Response to upwelling and implications for vertical export. *J. Geophys. Res.* 2001, 106, 4527–4542. [CrossRef]

- 57. Dewey, J.F.; Strachan, R.A. Changing Silurian–Devonian relative plate motion in the Caledonides: Sinistral transpression to sinistral transtension. *J. Geol. Soc.* 2003, *160*, 219–229. [CrossRef]
- 58. James, K. The Venezuelan Hydrocarbon Habitat. Geol. Soc. Lond. Spec. Publ. 1990, 50, 9–35. [CrossRef]
- Peach, B.N.; Horne, J. *The Silurian Rocks of Britain*; Vol.1 Scotland. (with Petrological Chapters and Notes by J.J.H. Teall); Memoirs of the Geological Survey of the United Kingdom; HMSO: Glasgow, UK, 1899; 749p.
- Walton, E.K.; Oliver, G.J.H. Lower Palaeozoic stratigraphy. In *Geology of Scotland*, 3rd ed.; Craig, G.Y., Ed.; Scottish Academic Press: Edinburgh, UK, 1991; pp. 161–193.
- 61. Anderson, L.I. A new specimen of the Silurian synziphosurine arthropod *Cyamocephalus*. *Proc. Geol. Assoc.* **1999**, *110*, 211–216. [CrossRef]
- 62. Hunter, J.R.S. Notes on a new fossil scorpion (*Palaeophonus caledonicus*) from the Upper Silurian Shales, Logan Water, Lesmahagow. *Trans. Edinb. Geol. Soc.* **1884**, *5*, 187–191. [CrossRef]
- 63. van der Brugghen, G.; Schram, F.R.; Marthill, D.M. The Fossil Ainiktozoon is an arthropod. Nature 1997, 385, 589–591. [CrossRef]
- Hessler, R.R.; Schram, F.R. Leptostraca as Living Fossils. In *Living Fossils. Casebooks in Earth Sciences*; Eldredge, N., Stanley, S.M., Eds.; Springer: New York, NY, USA, 1984; pp. 187–191. [CrossRef]
- Rolfe, W.D.I.; Beckett, E.C.M. Autecology of Silurian Xiphosurida, Scorpionida, Cirripedia, and Phyllocarida. Spec. Pap. Paleontol. 1984, 32, 27–37.
- 66. Albertoni, E.F.; Palma-Silva, C.; Esteves, F.A. Overlap of dietary niche and electivity of three shrimp species (Crustacea, Decapoda) in a tropical coastal lagoon (Rio de Janeiro, Brazil). *Rev. Bras. Zool.* **2003**, *20*, 135–140. [CrossRef]
- 67. Rolfe, W.D.I. Phyllocarida and the origin of the Malacostraca. Geobios 1981, 14, 17–26. [CrossRef]
- Walker, I. Omnivory and resource-sharing in nutrient-deficient Rio Negro waters: Stabilization of biodiversity? *Acta Amaz.* 2009, 39, 617–626. [CrossRef]
- 69. Traquair, R.H. Report on fossil fishes collected by the Geological Survey of Scotland in the Silurian rocks of the south of Scotland. *Trans. R. Soc. Edinb.* **1899**, *39*, 827–864. [CrossRef]
- 70. Turner, S. A new articulated thelodont (Agnatha) from the Early Devonian of Britain. Palaeontology 1982, 25, 879-889.
- Turner, S. Early Silurian to Early Devonian thelodont assemblages and their possible ecological significance. In *Palaeocommunities:* A Case Study from the Silurian and Lower Devonian-International Geological Correlation Programme 53, Project Ecostratigraphy, Final Report; Boucot, A.J., Lawson, J., Eds.; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 1999; pp. 42–78.
- 72. Gilmore, B. Scroll coprolites from the Silurian of Ireland and the feeding of early invertebrates. Palaeontology 1992, 35, 319–333.
- 73. Scourfield, D.J. An anomalous fossil organism, possibly a new type of chordate, from the Upper Silurian of Lesmahagow, Lanarkshire—Ainiktozoon loganense, gen. et sp. nov. *Proc. R. Soc. B* **1937**, *121*, 533–547. [CrossRef]
- Haug, C.; Briggs, D.E.G.; Mikulic, D.G.; Kluessendorf, J.; Huag, J.T. The implications of a Silurian and other thylacocephalan crustaceans for the functional morphology and systematic affinities of the group. *BMC Evol. Biol.* 2014, 14, 159. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 75. Störmer, L. Dictyocaris salter, a large crustacean from the Upper Silurian and Downtonian. Nor. Geol. Tidsskr. 1935, 15, 267–298.
- 76. van der Brugghen, G. Dictyocaris, een enigmatisch fossiel uit het Silur. Grondboor Hamer 1995, 1, 18–22.
- 77. Ritchie, A. *Lanarkopterus dolichoschelus* (Störmer) gen. nov., a mixopterid eurypterid from the Upper Silurian of the Lesmahagow and Hagshaw Hills inliers, Scotland. *Scott. J. Geol.* **1968**, *4*, 317–338. [CrossRef]
- 78. Schmidt, M.; Melzer, R.R.; Plotnick, R.E.; Bicknell, R.D.C. Spines and baskets in apex predatory sea scorpions uncover unique feeding strategies using 3D-kinematics. *Science* 2022, *25*, 103662. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 79. Plotnick, R.E. Habitat of Llandoverian-Lochkovian eurypterids. In *Paleocommunities—A Case Study from the Silurian and Lower Devonian;* Boucot, A.J., Lawson, J.D., Eds.; Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK, 1999; pp. 106–136.
- 80. Stanley, S.M. Functional morphology and evolution of byssally attached bivalves. J. Paleontol. 1972, 46, 165–212.
- 81. Linsley, R.M. Some "laws" of gastropod shell form. Paleobiology 1977, 3, 196-206. [CrossRef]
- 82. Denison, R.N. Feeding mechanisms of agnatha and early gnathostomes. Am. Zool. 1961, 1, 177–182. [CrossRef]
- 83. Donoghue, P.C.J.; Smith, M.P. The anatomy of *Turinia pagei* (Powrie), and the phylogenetic status of the Thelodonti. *Trans. R. Soc. Edinb. Earth Sci.* **2001**, *92*, 15–37. [CrossRef]
- Donoghue, P.C.J.; Forey, P.L.; Aldridge, R.J. Conodont affinity and chordate phylogeny. *Biol. Rev.* 2000, 75, 191–251. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 85. Ferrón, H.G.; Botella, H. Squamation and ecology of thelodonts. PLoS ONE 2017, 12, e0172781. [CrossRef]
- 86. Mallatt, J. Feeding ecology of the earliest vertebrates. Zool. J. Linn. Soc. 1984, 82, 261–272. [CrossRef]
- Mallatt, J. Reconstructing the Life Cycle and the Feeding of Ancestral Vertebrates. In *Evolutionary Biology of Primitive Fishes*; NATO ASI Series; Foreman, R.E., Gorbman, A., Dodd, J.M., Olsson, R., Eds.; Springer: Boston, MA, USA, 1985; Volume 103, pp. 59–68. [CrossRef]
- Lammons, M.L. Mud and Mucus: Feeding Selectivity in a Suspension-Feeding Detritivorous Fish. Master's Thesis, The College of William and Mary, Williamsburg, VA, USA, 2009; 101p.
- Parrington, F.R.; Westoll, T.S. On the nature of the Anaspida. In *Studies on Fossil Vertebrates*; Westoll, T.S., Ed.; Athlone Press: London, UK, 1958; pp. 108–128.
- 90. Kermack, K.A. The functional significance of the hypocercal Tail in Pteraspis rostrata. J. Exp. Biol. 1943, 20, 23–27. [CrossRef]

- 91. Fletcher, T.; Altringham, J.; Peakall, J.; Wignall, P.; Dorrell, R. Hydrodynamics of fossil fishes. *Proc. R. Soc.* 2014, *B281*, 20140703. [CrossRef]
- 92. Strahan, A. The behaviour of Mixinoids. Acta Zool. Stockh. 1963, 44, 73-102. [CrossRef]

Disclaimer/Publisher's Note: The statements, opinions and data contained in all publications are solely those of the individual author(s) and contributor(s) and not of MDPI and/or the editor(s). MDPI and/or the editor(s) disclaim responsibility for any injury to people or property resulting from any ideas, methods, instructions or products referred to in the content.